## Cindy's Cats

This problem gives you the chance to:

- solve fraction problems in a practical context

Cindy has 3 cats: Sammy, Tommy and Suzi.


1. Cindy feeds them on Cat Crunchies.

Each day Sammy eats $\frac{1}{2}$ of the box, Tommy eats $\frac{1}{8}$ of the box and Suzi eats $\frac{1}{4}$ of the box.
What fraction of a whole box do the cats eat, in all, each day?
Show how you figured this out.
2. Tommy and Suzi spend much of each day sleeping.

Tommy sleeps for $\frac{3}{5}$ of the day and Suzi sleeps for $\frac{7}{10}$ of the day.
Which of the two cats sleeps for longer?
How much longer does it sleep each day?
Show how you figured this out.
3. Cindy's cats often share a carton of cat milk.

Sammy always drinks $\frac{1}{3}$ of the carton, Tommy always drinks $\frac{5}{12}$ of the carton, and Suzi always drinks $\frac{1}{6}$ of the carton.

What fraction of the carton of cat milk is left over?
Show how you figured it out.
4. Cindy's cats love to jump in and out of their cat door.

Yesterday the cat door was used 100 times by her cats.


Sammy used it for $\frac{1}{4}$ of the times and Tommy used it for $\frac{3}{10}$ of the times.
How many times did Suzi use the cat door?
Explain how you figured it out.
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$
$\qquad$

## Task 3: Cindy's Cats

Rubric

The core elements of performance required by this task are:

- solve fraction problems in a practical context

Based on these, credit for specific aspects of performance should be assigned as follows

1. Gives correct answer: 7/8

Show work such as: $\quad 1 / 2+1 / 4+1 / 8=4 / 8+2 / 8+1 / 8=7 / 8$
2. Gives correct answer: Suzi by $\mathbf{1 / 1 0}$ of a day. Accept $10 \%$ or $2^{4} /{ }_{10}$ hours

Shows correct work such as: $3 / 5=6 / 10$ and so $7 / 10-6 / 10=1 / 10$
Accept work in percents.
3. Gives correct answer: $\mathbf{1 / 1 2}$

Shows correct work such as: $1 / 3+5 / 12+1 / 6=4 / 12+5 / 12+2 / 12=11 / 12$

$$
12 / 12-11 / 12=1 / 12
$$

Partial credit
Gives answer 11/12 and shows correct work.
4. Gives correct answer: $\mathbf{4 5}$ times

Gives correct explanations such as:
$1 / 4=25 / 100$ and $3 / 10=30 / 100 \quad$ So $25+30=55$
Therefore Sammy and Tommy used it 55 times. $100-55=45$
This means Suzi used it 45 times.
Partial credit
Gives answer such as $9 / 20,18 / 40$, or $45 \%$ and shows correct work.
1
1
1

1

## Cindy's Cats

Work the task and look at the rubric. What are the key mathematical ideas in this task?

When thinking about this task, students had access to the mathematics using a variety of strategies. Look at student work and see if you can categorize the strategies. Without judging whether the strategy was used with complete success, how many of your students attempted to use:

| Common <br> denominators | Decimals | Fractions <br> over 100 | Percents | Drawing or <br> using a <br> model | Invented $a$ <br> strategy |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |

Now look at student work for part one. This is the entry level portion for most students.
How many of your students seemed to understand that the operation was addition?
How many of your students tried some kind of subtraction?
How many of your students have work where the operation is unclear? $\qquad$
Look at the answers in part 1. How many of your students have answers of:

| $7 / 8$ | $87 \%$ | $3 / 14$ | $1 / 14$ | $3 / 4$ | $3 / 8$ | Whole <br> number | Other |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

What do students understand? What are students confused about? In each case is the confusion caused by misunderstood or incorrectly memorized algorithms or procedures? Is the confusion a result of opportunity to learn? Is the confusion caused by not being able to think about the meaning of fractions? Is the confusion caused by not understanding operations?

| Suzi <br> $1 / 10$ | Either <br> Whole number <br> answer | Either <br> $3 / 10$ | Each of <br> them slept <br> half a day | Either <br> $13 / 10$ | Tommy <br> $1 / 10$ | $4 / 10$ | $7 / 10$ | Other |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

Did any of your students attempt to change the fractions into hours in a day (make it into $24^{\text {th }}$, )? Were students struggling with identifying the correct operation?
Were students struggling with how to compare the fractions?

Many students understood that the operation involved in part 3 involved subtraction, but because they could only think about two fractions at a time they subtracted too early. What strategies do you use in class to help students figure out the correct operation for a problem? What kinds of models might help students make sense of the "action" of the problem?

Now look at student work for the final part of the task. What mathematics did students need to understand in order to work this task? What are the big mathematical ideas? What strategies do you think students have to make sense of this part of the task?

Look at student work. How many of your students put:

| 45 | 55 | $45 / 100$ or <br> $9 / 20$ | $55 / 100$ or <br> $22 / 40$ | $4 / 14$ | Other |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |

What is the piece each student is missing? How are they showing a different misconception?
What do you think are some of the layers that need to be developed to build a deep understanding of fractions?
What are some of the issues that arise in working in context that don't show up when students work a page of practice problems?

48

## Looking at Student Work on Cindy's Cats

An important part of solving word problems is understanding what you know and what is the result of each calculation. Student A makes use of clear labels to define the numbers in the problem and show why the calculations make sense. The student uses common denominators throughout. Student A is able to think about multiplication to find $1 / 4$ of 100 and $3 / 10$ of 100 .

## Student A

1. Cindy feeds them on Cat Crunchies.

Each day Sammy eats $\frac{1}{2}$ of the box, Tommy eats $\frac{1}{8}$ of the box and Suzi eats $\frac{1}{4}$ of the box.

What fraction of a whole box do the cats eat, in all, each day?


Show how you figured this out.

2. Tommy and Suzi spend much of each day sleeping.

Tommy sleeps for $\frac{3}{5}$ of the day and Suzi sleeps for $\frac{7}{10}$ of the day.
Which of the two cats sleeps for longer?
How much longer does it sleep each day?


Show how you figured this out.


## Student A, part 2

3. Cindy's cats often share a carton of cat milk.

Sammy always drinks $\frac{1}{3}$ of the carton, Tommy always drinks $\frac{5}{12}$ of the carton, and
Suzi always drinks $\frac{1}{6}$ of the carton.
What fraction of the carton of cat milk is left over?


Show how you figured it out.
I converted $\frac{1}{3}$ into $\frac{4}{12}$ (for Sammy), plus $\frac{5}{12}$,(for Tommy) and I also converted $\frac{1}{6}$ into $\frac{2}{12}$, (for Suzi) then I added $\frac{4}{12}+\frac{5}{12}+\frac{2}{12}=\left(\frac{11}{12}\right.$, then I did $\frac{12}{12}-\frac{11}{12}=\frac{1}{12}$ leftover. 11
4. Cindy's cats love to jump in and out of their cat door.

Yesterday the cat door was used 100 times by her cats.


Sammy used it for $\frac{1}{4}$ of the times and Tommy used it for $\frac{3}{10}$ of the times.
How many times did Suzi use the cat door?


Explain how you figured it out.


Student B also uses common denominators, but thinks through the three numbers in parts, showing a substitution of equivalent fractions in almost algebraic form. Notice that in part 4, the student attempts to use common denominators and then seems to switch to a different strategy in the written explanation. Again Student B has very clear labels to describe what each answer represents. What type of discourse or experience helps students to develop the ability to label answers or understand what is being found by doing a calculation?

## Student B

1. Cindy feeds them on Cat Crunchies.

Each day Sammy eats $\frac{1}{2}$ of the box, Tommy eats $\frac{1}{8}$ of the box and Suzi eats $\frac{1}{4}$ of the box.

What fraction of a whole box do the cats eat, in all, each day?
Show how you figured this out.


$$
\begin{aligned}
& \frac{1}{\frac{1}{2}}+\frac{1}{8} \\
& \frac{4}{8}+\frac{1}{8}+\frac{1}{4} \\
& \frac{2}{8}+\frac{4}{8}+\frac{1}{8}=\frac{7}{8}
\end{aligned}
$$

2. Tommy and Suzi spend much of each day sleeping.

Tommy sleeps for $\frac{3}{5}$ of the day and Suzi sleeps for $\frac{7}{10}$ of the day.
Which of the two cats sleeps for longer?
How much longer does it sleep each day?
Show how you figured this out.

$\frac{7}{10}-\frac{6}{10}=\frac{1}{10}, V$

## Student B, part 2

3. Cindy's cats often share a carton of cat milk.

Sammy always drinks $\frac{1}{3}$ of the carton, Tommy always drinks $\frac{5}{12}$ of the carton, and Suzi always drinks $\frac{1}{6}$ of the carton.
What fraction of the carton of cat milk is left over?
Show how you figured it out.

4. Cindy's cats love to jump in and out of their cat door.

Yesterday the cat door was used 100 times by her cats.
Sammy used it for $\frac{1}{4}$ of the times and Tommy used it for $\frac{3}{10}$ of the times.
How many times did Suzi use the cat door?


Explain how you figured it out.

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { Explain how you figured it out. } \\
& \text { I Keven that } \frac{1}{4} \text { of } 100 \text { was } 25 \text { and } \frac{3}{10} \text { or } \frac{30}{100} \\
& \text { was } 30 \text { out of } 100 \text { so Tommy used } 30 \text { times. }
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
\text { Both of those together are } 55 \text { times. \$0d-ss = }
$$

$$
\frac{10}{40}+\frac{12}{40}=\frac{22}{40}
$$



Student C is able to use diagrams to make sense of the size of the fractions and show the action or operation of the problems. In part 2, Student C shows the comparison in two different ways. Can you describe the mathematics in each diagram?

## Student C

1. Cindy feeds them on Cat Crunchies.

Each day Sammy eats $\frac{1}{2}$ of the box, Tommy eats $\frac{1}{8}$ of the box and Suzi eats $\frac{1}{4}$ of the box.
What fraction of a whole box do the cats eat, in all, each day? Show how you figured this out.

2. Tommy and Suzi spend much of each day sleeping.

Tommy sleeps for $\frac{3}{5}$ of the day and Suzi sleeps for $\frac{7}{10}$ of the day.
Which of the two cats sleeps for longer?
How much longer does it sleep each day?
Show how you figured this out.


## Student C, part 2

3. Cindy's cats often share a carton of cat milk.

Sammy always drinks $\frac{1}{3}$ of the carton, Tommy always drinks $\frac{5}{12}$ of the carton, and
Suzi always drinks $\frac{1}{6}$ of the carton.
What fraction of the carton of cat milk is left over?


Show how you figured it out.

4. Cindy's cats love to jump in and out of their cat door.

Yesterday the cat door was used 100 times by her cats.


Sammy used it for $\frac{1}{4}$ of the times and Tommy used it for $\frac{3}{10}$ of the times.
How many times did Suzi use the cat door?


Explain how you figured it out.


Student D uses percents to think about the situation in part 4.

## Student D

$1<$
4. Cindy's cats love to jump in and out of their cat door.

Yesterday the cat door was used 100 times by her cats.


Sammy used it for $\frac{1}{4}$ of the times and Tommy used it for $\frac{3}{10}$ of the times.
How many times did Suzi use the cat door?

$$
45 \text { times }
$$

Explain how you figured it out.


$$
30+25=55 \quad 100-55=45
$$

$\qquad$

In part 4, students had a difficult time interpreting their answers. Student E has done all the correct calculations, but can't break down the meaning of the final answer from the number 45/100 to the meaning 45 times out of 100 . What kind of question could you pose to the class to get everyone thinking about what the 45/100 represents?

## Student E

Yesterday the cat door was used 100 times by her cats.


Sammy used it for $\frac{1}{4}$ of the times and Tommy used it for $\frac{3}{10}$ of the times.
How many times did Suzi use the cat door? Explain how you figured it out.

$$
\operatorname{dr} \frac{45}{100}=\frac{9}{20}
$$


$\checkmark$ Then I subtracted 55 from 100, and my answer was 45 , and 1 turned 45 into the fraction that Suzi used the cat

$$
\begin{aligned}
\frac{1}{4}=\frac{25}{100} \quad \frac{3}{10}=\frac{30}{100} & \frac{25}{100} \\
& +\frac{\frac{30}{100}}{\frac{55}{100}}
\end{aligned}
$$

Student F is able to use common denominators and goes the extra step to show how to find the denominators. Student F also struggles with understanding the meaning of the calculations. In part two the student is able to make the comparison by finding common denominators, and can see that there is a difference of one part. However, instead of thinking of the one as one part out of ten the student thinks about a day and converts it to 1 hour with an implied out of 24 . What kind of discourse can help students think about the whole or what it means to be a fraction of day? Why don't you use the 24 hours? In part 4, the student has trouble thinking about the meaning of operations. The student understands that there is a subtraction, but doesn't understand "the whole" or quantity being subtracted from. The student also realizes that the answer is a whole number (number of times), but doesn't understand what part of the fraction makes sense.

## Student F

1. Cindy feeds them on Cat Crunches.

Each day Sammy eats $\frac{1}{2}$ of the box, Tommy eats $\frac{1}{8}$ of the box and Suzi eats $\frac{1}{4}$ of the box.
What fraction of a whole box do the cats eat, in all, each day?
Show how you figured this out.

2. Tommy and Suzi spend much of each day sleeping.

Tommy sleeps for $\frac{3}{5}$ of the day and Suzi sleeps for $\frac{7}{10}$ of the day.
Which of the two cats sleeps for longer?


How much longer does it sleep each day? $\qquad$
Show how you figured this out.


## Student F, part 2

3. Cindy's cats often share a carton of cat milk.

Sammy always drinks $\frac{1}{3}$ of the carton, Tommy always drinks $\frac{5}{12}$ of the carton, and
Suzi always drinks $\frac{1}{6}$ of the carton.
What fraction of the carton of cat milk is left over?


Show how you figured it out.

4. Cindy's cats love to jump in and out of their cat door.

Yesterday the cat door was used 100 times by her cats.


Sammy used it for $\frac{1}{4}$ of the times and Tommy used it for $\frac{3}{10}$ of the times.
How many times did Suzi use the cat door?
 -
Explain how you figured it out.


Student G has trouble choosing the operation in part 2 of the task. This is a comparison or subtraction operation and the student makes the common mistake of trying to add. In part 4 the student knows that subtraction is involved by doesn't have the correct whole, 100 times, to subtract from. The student also misses the idea of interpreting the answer from a fraction to number of times. How do we help push students to develop the logical reasoning needed to interpret what is being asked versus what is being calculated? This is important, because the nuances of logic needed to interpret the answer don't come up when students do practice exercises, but only arise through working tasks with rich contexts. Do you think you give students enough opportunity to work and discuss mathematics in context?

## Student G

1. Cindy feeds them on Cat Crunchies.

Each day Sammy eats $\frac{1}{2}$ of the box, Tommy eats $\frac{1}{8}$ of the box and Suzi eats $\frac{1}{4}$ of
the box.
What fraction of a whole box do the cats eat, in all, each day? $\qquad$ 11

Show how you figured this out.
$+\frac{1}{2}=\frac{4}{8}$
$\frac{1}{8}=\frac{1}{8}=\frac{7}{8}$
$\frac{1}{4}=\frac{2}{8}$

2. Tommy and Suzi spend much of each day sleeping.

Tommy sleeps for $\frac{3}{5}$ of the day and Suzi sleeps for $\frac{7}{10}$ of the day.
Which of the two cats sleeps for longer?
How much longer does it sleep each day?


Show how you figured this out.
$-\frac{7}{10}=\frac{7}{10}=\frac{13}{10}$ or $1 \frac{3}{10}$
$\frac{3}{5}=\frac{6}{10} x$.

3. Cindy's cats often share a carton of cat milk.

Sammy always drinks $\frac{1}{3}$ of the carton, Tommy always drinks $\frac{5}{12}$ of the carton, and
Suzi always drinks $\frac{1}{6}$ of the carton.
What fraction of the carton of cat milk is left over? $\frac{1}{12}$
Show how you figured it out.

4. Cindy's cats love to jump in and out of their cat door.

Yesterday the cat door was used 100 times by her cats.


Sammy used it for $\frac{1}{4}$ of the times and Tommy used it for $\frac{3}{10}$ of the times.
How many times did Suzi use the cat door?
 Explain how you figured it out.
 So I changed the denominator to twenty and then the problem was $\frac{6}{25}-\frac{5}{20}=\frac{1}{20} \times$.



Student H has a total score of 3, but shows a lot of understanding about fractions. The student is able to choose a common denominator and find equivalent fractions in order to add or subtract fractions. The student is able to add and to subtract fractions with unlike denominators. The student is not able to choose correct operations or identify what is being asked for. The student is a great calculator, but doesn't know how to think about solving problems in context.

## Student H

1. Cindy feeds them on Cat Crunchies.

Each day Sammy eats $\frac{1}{2}$ of the box, Tommy eats $\frac{1}{8}$ of the box and Suzi eats $\frac{1}{4}$ of the box.
What fraction of a whole box do the cats eat, in all, each day?


Show how you figured this out.

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{4}{4}=\frac{4}{8} \\
& \frac{1}{8} \cdot \frac{1}{1}=\frac{1}{8} \\
& +\frac{1}{4} \cdot \frac{2}{2}=\frac{2}{8}
\end{aligned}
$$


2. Tommy and Suzi spend much of each day sleeping.

Tommy sleeps for $\frac{3}{5}$ of the day and Suzi sleeps for $\frac{7}{10}$ of the day.
Which of the two cats sleeps for longer?
How much longer does it sleep each day?


Show how you figured this out.



Cindy's Cats Test 5

## Student H, part 2

Sammy always drinks $\frac{1}{3}$ of the carton, Tommy always drinks $\frac{5}{12}$ of the carton, and Suzi always drinks $\frac{1}{6}$ of the carton.
What fraction of the carton of cat milk is left over?


Show how you figured it out.

4. Cindy's cats love to jump in and out of their cat door.

Yesterday the cat door was used 100 times by her cats.


Sammy used it for $\frac{1}{4}$ of the times and Tommy used it for $\frac{3}{10}$ of the times.
How many times did Suzi use the cat door?


Explain how you figured it out.


Student I also has a score of 3 , but shows a very different profile of understanding. In part one, the student seems to want all fractions to be parts of 100 and actually makes correct calculations.
However, the student tries to relate $87.5 \%$ back to a fraction and does that conversion incorrectly. In part 2 the student tries to find parts of the day by changing to a denominator of 24 . The fraction conversions are messy and strategy breaks down in trying to deal with the remainders but could have yielded a correct solution. In part 3 the student again tries to make everything into parts of 100, but again has trouble dealing with the remainders. This strategy serves the student well in the final part of the task. What might be some next steps for this student?

## Student I

Cindy has 3 cats: Sammy, Tommy and Suzi.


1. Cindy feeds them on Cat Crunchies.


Each day Sammy eats $\frac{1}{2}$ of the box, Tommy eats $\frac{1}{8}$ of the box and Suzi eats $\frac{1}{4}$ of
the box.
the box.
What fraction of a whole box do the cats eat, in all, each day?
Show how you figured this out.

2. Tommy and Suzi spend much of each day sleeping.

Tommy sleeps for $\frac{3}{5}$ of the day and Suzi sleeps for $\frac{7}{10}$ of the day.
Which of the two cats sleeps for longer?
How much longer does it sleep each day?


Show how you figured this out.

## Student I, part 2


3. Cindy's cats often share a carton of cat milk.


Sammy always drinks $\frac{1}{3}$ of the carton, Tommy always drinks $\frac{5}{12}$ of the carton, and
Suzi always drinks $\frac{1}{6}$ of the carton.
What fraction of the carton of cat milk is left over?


Show how you figured it out.

4. Cindy's cats love to jump in and out of their cat door.

Yesterday the cat door was used 100 times by her cats.


Sammy used it for $\frac{1}{4}$ of the times and Tommy used it for $\frac{3}{10}$ of the times.

How many times did Suzi use the cat door?


Explain how you figured it out.


Student J also tries to work with parts of 100 in part 1, but doesn't understand what to do with the remainder for $1 / 8$. The student did not attempt other parts of the task. What are some of the skills the student has that you can use to build further understanding?

## Student J

1. Cindy feeds them on Cat Crunchies.

Each day Sammy eats $\frac{1}{2}$ of the box, Tommy eats $\frac{1}{8}$ of the box and Suzi eats $\frac{1}{4}$ of the box.

What fraction of a whole box do the cats eat, in all, each day?


Show how you figured this out.

2. Tommy and Suzi spend much of each day sleeping.

Student K works with the fractions in sets of two. Although the student has a score of 2, the student shows a great deal of understanding in some areas. In part one the student chooses the correct operation for the task, converts to an appropriate common denominator (actually working quite hard because each set requires a different denominator), and adds correctly. The student doesn't simplify the final answer correctly. Thinking about the problem in chunks makes it difficult to choose an operation in part three. While the overall action is subtracting or finding what's left over, this action doesn't happen until after the other quantities are totaled. Then the student needs to put in an implied quantity, the whole. It would be interesting to interview a student with this type of error to see how he or she might solve a similar task involving just whole numbers. Would the student then see the addition? What do you think this student's personal algorithm is for finding denominators? Why does this make the task more difficult? What activities might help the student see the logic and simplicity of finding a smaller common denominator? What questions might you pose to the class?

## Student K

1. Cindy feeds them on Cat Crunchies.

Each day Sammy eats $\frac{1}{2}$ of the box, Tommy eats $\frac{1}{8}$ of the box and Suzi eats $\frac{1}{4}$ of the box.
What fraction of a whole box do the cats eat, in all, each day?
Show how you figured this out.



$x$.
00
2. Tommy and Suzi spend much of each day sleeping.

Tommy sleeps for $\frac{3}{5}$ of the day and Suzi sleeps for $\frac{7}{10}$ of the day.
Which of the two cats sleeps for longer?
How much longer does it sleep each day?


Show how you figured this out.

Copyright © 2007 by Mathematics Assessment
Resource Service. All rights reserved

3. Cindy's cats often share a carton of cat milk.

Sammy always drinks $\frac{1}{3}$ of the carton, Tommy always drinks $\frac{5}{12}$ of the carton, and
Suzi always drinks $\frac{1}{6}$ of the carton.
What fraction of the carton of cat milk is left over?
Show how you figured it out.

4. Cindy's cats love to jump in and out of their cat door.

Yesterday the cat door was used 100 times by her cats.


| Student Task | Solve fraction problems in a practical context. Use part/ whole <br> relationships to solve problems. |
| :--- | :--- |
| Core Idea 2 | Understand the meanings of operations and how they relate to each <br> other, make reasonable estimates and compute fluently. <br> Number <br> Operations |
|  | Reason about and solve problem situations that involve more <br> than one operation in multi-step problems. |
|  | Use equivalent forms to add and subtract commonly used <br> fractions. <br> Develop and use strategies to solve problems involving number <br> operations with fractions relevant to students' experience. |

Based on teacher observations, this is what fifth graders knew and were able to do:

- Find common denominators
- Convert to equivalent fractions

Areas of difficulty for fifth graders:

- Choosing operations in word problems
- Drawing accurate diagrams for fractions
- Interpreting what their calculations represent
- Understanding that fractions need to be converted to common denominators
- Choosing convenient common denominators (e.g. trying to switch to $24^{\text {th }}$ 's in part 2 was too difficult or interpreting remainders when trying to convert to $100^{\text {th }}$ 's was difficult)
Strategies used by successful students:
- Using common denominators
- Labeling their work and their answers as they worked through the different steps
- Using percents
- Using accurate models (built with common denominators)

Task 3 - Cindy's Cats
Mean: $3.67 \quad$ StdDev: 3.10

Table 27: Frequency Distribution of MARS Test Task 3, Grade 5

| Task 3 <br> Scores | Student <br> Count | \% at or <br> below | \% at or <br> above |
| :---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| 0 | 2842 | $30.7 \%$ | $100.0 \%$ |
| 1 | 492 | $36.0 \%$ | $69.3 \%$ |
| 2 | 668 | $43.2 \%$ | $64.0 \%$ |
| 3 | 455 | $48.1 \%$ | $56.8 \%$ |
| 4 | 665 | $55.3 \%$ | $51.9 \%$ |
| 5 | 615 | $61.9 \%$ | $44.7 \%$ |
| 6 | 1045 | $73.2 \%$ | $38.1 \%$ |
| 7 | 1101 | $85.1 \%$ | $26.8 \%$ |
| 8 | 1384 | $100.0 \%$ | $14.9 \%$ |

Figure 36: Bar Graph of MARS Test Task 3 Raw Scores, Grade 5


The maximum score available for this task is 8 points.
The minimum score for a level 3 response, meeting standards, is 4 points.
More than half the students, $69 \%$, were able to find an answer to part one, but may have struggled with showing their steps. About half the students, $52 \%$, could use common denominators to add 3 fractions in part one of the task and use common denominators to compare fractions in part 2 . Almost $40 \%$ of the students could also use addition and subtract from 1 whole to find the solution to part 3 . Almost $15 \%$ could meet all the demands of task including interpreting 45/100 to mean 45 times out of 100 . Almost $31 \%$ of the students scored no points on this task. $98 \%$ of the students with this score attempted the task.

Cindy's Cats

| Points | Understandings | Misunderstandings |
| :---: | :--- | :--- |
| $\mathbf{0}$ | 98\% of the students with this score <br> attempted the task. | Students did not understand how to <br> work with common denominators. More <br> than 12\% added denominators to get <br> $3 / 14$ or 1/14. 5\% added two of the three <br> fractions to get 3/8 or 3/5. Other <br> common errors for part 1 included 3/4, <br> $1,87 \%$. |
| $\mathbf{1}$ | Most students with this score had a <br> correct answer to part 1, but did not <br> show enough of their work. | Students struggled with making the <br> comparison.7\% thought Suzi had 4/5 <br> more and 3\% thought Tommy had 4/5 <br> more. 7\% knew Suzi had the most but <br> didn't quantify the difference and just <br> wrote 7/10. 13\% tried to find the number <br> of hours (1 to 15 hours). Many students <br> struggled with choosing the correct <br> operation, adding instead of subtracting. |
| $\mathbf{4}$ | Students with this score could <br> usually solve all of part 1 and 2, <br> adding fractions with unlike <br> denominators and doing comparison <br> subtraction with fractions. | Students had difficulty identifying the <br> operation in part 3 or understanding that <br> the subtraction was from 1 whole and <br> not other fractions. 5\% forgot to <br> subtract and had answers of 11/12. 5\% <br> thought the answer was 1/2. Another <br> $5 \% ~ h a d ~ a n s w e r s ~ o f ~ 1 . ~ O t h e r ~ c o m m o n ~$ |
| errors were 1/4, 5/12, and 2/3. |  |  |

## Implications for Instruction

Students need practice working with fractions in context. They should have a variety of strategies for combining fractions: models, common denominators, changing fractions to decimals or percents. Students should also be able to compare fractions to find out which is larger and subtract fractions from 1 whole.
Some students are still having difficulty choosing operations. Work with bar models might help them to clarify the action of the story problems.

## Ideas for Action Research

## Looking at student work:

Often when planning remediation or helping students who are behind, teachers think about the students who are almost there. What are the few steps they need to be successful? But what is it that the students who are at the lowest end of the spectrum need? How are their issues different?

Sit down with colleagues and examine the following pieces of student work. Consider the following questions:

1. What are the strengths, if any, that the student has? What does the student understand about the meaning of fractions? What does the student know about procedures with fractions? What are the concepts the students understand about the situation? How might these strengths be used to help build their understanding of the whole situation?
2. Is the student making appropriate choices of operations? Do you think the student could pick the correct operation if given a similar problem with whole numbers? What is your evidence? How do students learn to identify the action of the story?
3. How did students use representations? Were the representations accurate? Why or why not? What would have helped the student to improve their representation? Could their representation be modified in some way to solve the problem?
4. What is the role of labels in understanding what is known and what needs to be found? How does using labels help students to understand what they have calculated and interpret the meaning of the calculation? (This seems especially critical in part 4)
5. What misunderstandings does the student have? What skills is the student missing? What does this suggest about a specific course of action to help this student?
6. How are the needs of each of these students the same or different?

After your have carefully looked at each piece of student work, see if you can devise a plan of experiences/ discussions/ tools that might help these students to make more sense of these situations. While you don't have these exact students in your class, each member of the group will probably have students with similar misunderstandings. Identify students who you think are low and plan different approaches for attacking the problems outlined here. Have each person in the group try out a different course of action and report back on the how the lesson or series of lessons effected the targeted students. See if you can all use some similar starting problems and bring work of the students to share. What types of activities or experiences made the most noticeable improvement in student work?

## Arnold

1. Cindy feeds them on Cat Crunchies.

Each day Sammy eats $\frac{1}{2}$ of the box, Tommy eats $\frac{1}{8}$ of the box and Suzi eats $\frac{1}{4}$ of the box.

What fraction of a whole box do the cats eat, in all, each day?


Show how you figured this out.

$$
\begin{array}{lll}
\frac{1}{2} \times \frac{8}{8}=\frac{8}{16} & \frac{8}{16}+\frac{2}{16}=\frac{10}{16} & \frac{1}{4} \times \frac{10}{10}=\frac{10}{64} \times 0 \\
\frac{1}{8} \times \frac{2}{2}=\frac{2}{16} & \frac{10}{16} \times \frac{4}{4}=\frac{40}{64} & \frac{40}{64}+\frac{10}{64}=\frac{50}{60}+2=\frac{2}{38}
\end{array}
$$

2. Tommy and Suzi spend much of each day sleeping.
Tommy sleeps for $\frac{3}{5}$ of the day and Suzi sleeps for $\frac{7}{10}$ of the day.
$\frac{25}{30}+5=\frac{5}{6}$

Which of the two cats sleeps for longer?
How much longer does it sleep each day?
 0

Show how you figured this out.

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \frac{3}{5} \times \frac{10}{10}=\frac{30}{50}=\operatorname{Tommy} \quad \frac{30}{50}-\frac{21}{50}=\frac{9}{50} \\
& \frac{7}{10} \times \frac{3}{5}=\frac{21}{50}=5021
\end{aligned}
$$

3. Cindy's cats often share a carton of cat milk.

Sammy always drinks $\frac{1}{3}$ of the carton, Tommy always drinks $\frac{5}{12}$ of the carton, and
Suzi always drinks $\frac{1}{6}$ of the carton.
What fraction of the carton of cat milk is left over?

$$
\frac{18}{216} \times 00
$$

Show how you figured it out.

4. Cindy's cats love to jump in and out of their cat door.

Sammy used it for $\frac{1}{4}$ of the times and Tommy used it for $\frac{3}{10}$ of the times.
How many times did Suzi use the cat door?
Explain how you figured it out.


## Berta

1. Cindy feeds them on Cat Crunchies.

Each day Sammy eats $\frac{1}{2}$ of the box, Tommy eats $\frac{1}{8}$ of the box and Suzi eats $\frac{1}{4}$ of the box.
What fraction of a whole box do the cats eat, in all, each day
Show how you figured this out.

$$
\frac{1}{2}+\frac{1}{8}+\frac{1}{4}=\frac{3}{14} x
$$

$\frac{\frac{121 / 2}{14} \times 0}{\text { a whe16 }}$ box
2. Tommy and Suzi spend much of each day sleeping.

Tommy sleeps for $\frac{3}{5}$ of the day and Suzi sleeps for $\frac{7}{10}$ of the day.
Which of the two cats sleeps for longer?


How much longer does it sleep each day?
Show how you figured this out.


00
3. Cindy's cats often share a carton of cat milk.

Sammy always drinks $\frac{1}{3}$ of the carton, Tommy always drinks $\frac{5}{12}$ of the carton, and
Suzi always drinks $\frac{1}{6}$ of the carton.
What fraction of the carton of cat milk is left over?


Show how you figured it out.

$$
\frac{1}{3}+\frac{1}{6}+\frac{5}{12}=\frac{7}{21}=\frac{1}{3} x
$$

4. Cindy's cats love to jump in and out of their cat door.

Yesterday the cat door was used 100 times by her cats.


Sammy used it for $\frac{1}{4}$ of the times and Tommy used it for $\frac{3}{10}$ of the times.
How many times did Suzi use the cat door?
Explain how you figured it out.

$$
\frac{10^{x}}{14} \operatorname{times} 0^{0}
$$



$$
\frac{1}{4}+\frac{3}{10}=\frac{4}{14}
$$

## Carl

Cindy has 3 cats: Sammy, Tommy and Suzi.


1. Cindy feeds them on Cat Crunchies.

Each day Sammy eats $\frac{1}{2}$ of the box, Tommy eats $\frac{1}{8}$ of the box and Suzi eats $\frac{1}{4}$ of the box.
What fraction of a whole box do the cats eat, in all, each day? $\times 1 / 2$ Show how you figured this out.

## $x$

2. Tommy and Suzi spend much of each day sleeping.

Tommy sleeps for $\frac{3}{5}$ of the day and Suzi sleeps for $\frac{7}{10}$ of the day.
Which of the two cats sleeps for longer?
 $0 \times 0$

How much longer does it sleep each day?
Show how you figured this out.

$$
x \frac{\text { Theyentone }}{\text { hadzench }} \text { doy } 0
$$

3. Cindy's cats often share a carton of cat milk.

Sammy always drinks $\frac{1}{3}$ of the carton, Tommy always drinks $\frac{5}{12}$ of the carton, and
Suzi always drinks $\frac{1}{6}$ of the carton.
What fraction of the carton of cat milk is left over?


Show how you figured it out.
4. Cindy's cats love to jump in and out of their cat door.

Yesterday the cat door was used 100 times by her cats.


Sammy used it for $\frac{1}{4}$ of the times and Tommy used it for $\frac{3}{10}$ of the times.
How many times did Suzi use the cat door?
 0
Explain how you figured it out.


## Dorothy

1. Cindy feeds them on Cat Crunchies.

Each day Sammy eats $\frac{1}{2}$ of the box, Tommy eats $\frac{1}{8}$ of the box and Suzi eats $\frac{1}{4}$ of
the box.
What fraction of a whole box do the cats eat, in all, each day?
Show how you figured this out.

2. Tommy and Suzi spend much of each day sleeping.

Tommy sleeps for $\frac{3}{5}$ of the day and Suzi sleeps for $\frac{7}{10}$ of the day.
Which of the two cats sleeps for longer?


How much longer does it sleep each day?
Show how you figured this out.

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \varnothing \text { प X } \square \square T o m m y \\
& \square \triangle \triangle B \not \subset \boxed{O} O D \text { Sufi }
\end{aligned}
$$


3. Cindy's cats often share a carton of cat milk.

Sammy always drinks $\frac{1}{3}$ of the carton, Tommy always drinks $\frac{5}{12}$ of the carton, and
Suzi always drinks $\frac{1}{6}$ of the carton.
What fraction of the carton of cat milk is left over?


Show how you figured it out.

4. Cindy's cats love to jump in and out of their cat door.

Yesterday the cat door was used 100 times by her cats.
Sammy used it for $\frac{1}{4}$ of the times and Tommy used it for $\frac{3}{10}$ of the times.
How many times did Suzi use the cat door?


Explain how you figured it out


## Ernie

1. Cindy feeds them on Cat Crunchies.

Each day Sammy eats $\frac{1}{2}$ of the box, Tommy eats $\frac{1}{8}$ of the box and Suzi eats $\frac{1}{4}$ of the box.

What fraction of a whole box do the cats eat, in all, each day?
Show how you figured this out.

2. Tommy and Suzi spend much of each day sleeping.

Tommy sleeps for $\frac{3}{5}$ of the day and Suzi sleeps for $\frac{7}{10}$ of the day.
Which of the two cats sleeps for longer?
How much longer does it sleep each day?


Copyright © 2007 by Mathematics Assessment
Page 4
Cindy's rate Toot 5
3. Cindy's cats often share a carton of cat milk.

Sammy always drinks $\frac{1}{3}$ of the carton, Tommy always drinks $\frac{5}{12}$ of the carton, and
Suzi always drinks $\frac{1}{6}$ of the carton.
What fraction of the carton of cat milk is left over?
Show how you figured it out.

4. Cindy's cats love to jump in and out of their cat door.

Yesterday the cat door was used 100 times by her cats.


Sammy used it for $\frac{1}{4}$ of the times and Tommy used it for $\frac{3}{10}$ of the times.
How many times did Suzi use the cat door?


Explain how you figured it out.


## Fanny

Cindy has 3 cats: Sammy, Tommy and Sui.


1. Cindy feeds them on Cat Crunches.

Each day Sammy eats $\frac{1}{2}$ of the box, Tommy eats $\frac{1}{8}$ of the box and Suzi eats $\frac{1}{4}$ of the box.

What fraction of a whole box do the cats eat, in all, each day?


Show how you figured this out.

$$
\frac{1}{2}+\frac{1}{8}+\frac{1}{4}=\frac{8}{8}=1 \text { whole } x
$$


2. Tommy and Suzi spend much of each day sleeping.

Tommy sleeps for $\frac{3}{5}$ of the day and Suzi sleeps for $\frac{7}{10}$ of the day.
Which of the two cats sleeps for longer?
How much longer does it sleep each day?


Show how you figured this out.


## Fanny, part 2

3. Cindy's cats often share a carton of cat milk.

Sammy always drinks $\frac{1}{3}$ of the carton, Tommy always drinks $\frac{5}{12}$ of the carton, and
Suzi always drinks $\frac{1}{6}$ of the carton.
What fraction of the carton of cat milk is left over?


Show how you figured it out.


Sammy used it for $\frac{1}{4}$ of the times and Tommy used it for $\frac{3}{10}$ of the times.
How many times did Suzi use the cat door?


Explain how you figured it out.


